MOHAMMAD ALI JAMAL ZADEH AND MAHMOUD TIMUR SHORT STORIES

MOHAMMAD ALI JAMALZADEH Y MAHMOUD TIMUR HISTORIAS CORTAS

RESUMEN
La investigación actual comparará las historias cortas de Mohammad Ali Jamal Zadeh y de Mahmoud Timur conocido como "Érase una vez". En esta investigación, se ha utilizado el método de análisis de contenido. Los resultados mostraron que el ciclo de oposición de los personajes existe en los libros de Timur más que en los de Jamal Zadeh, Jamal Zadeh usó el punto de vista en primera persona, pero Timur usó el punto de vista en tercera persona, y las historias de Timur estaban más cerca de las historias modernas.

Palabras clave: Tradición, modernidad, cuento, Jamal Zadeh, Timur

ABSTRACT
The current research will compare the short stories by Mohammad Ali Jamal Zadeh and by Mahmoud Timur known as "Once Upon a Time". In this research, the content analysis method has been used. Results showed that the Opposing cycle of characters exists in the Timur books more than in Jamal Zadeh, Jamal Zadeh used the first-person point of view but Timur used the third person point of view, and the stories of Timur were closer to modern stories.

Keywords: Tradition, modernity, short story, Jamal Zadeh, Timur

Fecha de recepción: junio 2019
Fecha de aprobación: octubre 2019

1 Associate Professor of Allameh Tabataba'i University, Department of Arabic Language and Literature. abdolpariz2018@yahoo.com. https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0510-0356.
INTRODUCTION

Iran and Egypt as two countries with brilliant cultural and civilizational backgrounds and also due to their population and differences from other countries in the region have always been influenced by West in economic, political, social and particularly cultural fields. Then, confrontation of cultures was among the great challenges of these two countries. The emergence of modernistic thoughts and transformation of values led to the creation of new forms and types of fictional literature which accelerated the emergence of modernity.

Fictional literature in this era was revolutionized in form and content. The formation of various types of story in this era was an answer to the necessity of expression of new thoughts in the new form.

One of these new fictional types is the short story which came to eastern lands from west. Despite its modern content, it contained elements from narrative heritage.

Modern story in the time of its genesis is the line between the traditional and modern worlds. Thus, early stories written in this era were related with story writing traditions, on the one hand, and shared some common borders with modern fiction, on the other hand. The dialectic of tradition and modernity in the course of these transformations in the age of genesis of modern fictional literature is considerable. This was indeed an era in which story was departing from previous ancient traditions and developing relations with modern structures.

The current research will compare the short stories by Mohammad Ali Jamal Zadeh and by Mahmoud Timur known as "Once Upon a Time". The present article studies the reciprocal conflicts of the two collected stories through the dual conflicts and paradoxical symbols. Moreover, the elements of traditional world and modernity were investigated based on their dual paradoxes whose elements enlightened the line between the narrative heritage and fiction in the modern sense.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Some of the fictional titles of these two collected works are in line with the context of the story while some others are in opposition with the context of the story. Among the examples of the opposition of title and text, the titles of "Stomachache of Mullah Qurbanali", "Al Sheikh Jomeh", "Amm Motavali", "Zarih al-Arabaen" and "Allah Yarhamuhu" can be highlighted that create a religious foreground in the reader's mind. While, having read the text of story, the mental presuppositions of the reader are broken, and the religious criticism of the author is reflected.
This inversion of the title in the text of story creates content-based conflict between the title and text. In the title "Statesman", the reader thinks that he is confronted with a serious story Man (Balighi, Abdi & Gheysari, 2016).

However, the irony of word and feeble character of politicians refuse this hypothesis. This title has a noble symbol in itself and is in conflict with the dominant poverty in the text of story. Such an opposition is one of the techniques for attracting the reader and persuading him to continue to read the story (Ingavale, 2016; Fallahi & Taheri, 2015).

Moreover, it is one of the manifestations of modernism in the story. Since "contemporary literature" sometimes the title has no direct relationship with the work, most of the contemporary artists have phenomenological vision toward reality. Their perception of the surrounding world is discontinuous and includes disperse elements which cannot be unified under a universal title (Nikpanah, 2018).

In the stories of Timur the urban spaces like Egypt and Cairo are in conflict with rural places like villages. The life of characters of the stories at village and city creates certain intellectual and behavioral differences in them.

It is interesting to note that sometimes the action of characters of stories is in conflict with the place where the action takes place. Sometimes silence and sound are in conflict with each other. For example, the opposition of silence and sound in the story of "Stomachache of Mulla Qurbanali is a good manifestation in this regard, a horrible sound of shooting raised, and it turned silent soon.

In the story of Allah Yarhamuhu opposing sounds are of high frequency, e.g. the sounds of jurists who murmuringly recite Quran and the sound of beggars who insult while they are shouting. The conflict between silence and sound can be seen in the space of Zarih al-Albaein (Timur, 2015, p. 68). In all these pictures silence is dominant.

In Bilah Dig Bilah Chughandar Jamalzadeh describes Iranian social classes according to the color of their clothes, because the clothes of Darvishes is white and the clothes of Iranian woman is black, and the men wear either yellow or black or white hats. In Al Sheikh Jomeh Timur presents the red turban of Sheikh and his gray beard and brunette face (symbol of happiness) as the opposite of the black land. The redness in the story Father and Son is the symbol for the idea of killing the father.
METHODS

In the first step, the main question and variables of the study were identified. After selecting the research question and variables, a set of documents or messages from these two books were collected and personalized to answer these questions. These documents and messages were then categorized into categories, with a code and a code for each of these categories. Finally, the word, phrase, theme, sentence and content were selected as the unit of analysis and final analysis was conducted.

RESULTS

Binary opposition constitutes the foundation of linguistics. This term was used for the first time by Trubetzkoy (2016) and after him other theoreticians developed this concept and considered it to be the "most fundamental notion in structuralism (Barthes, 2014) and the "basis of every text" which is hidden in the essence of language. In this essay by taking the theory of binary opposition as developed by the western thinkers, it was sought to study the binary oppositions governing the structure of stories of Jamalzadeh and Timur.

OPPOSITE TITLES: CONTENT-CENTEREDNESS OF JAMAL ZADEH AND LANGUAGE-CENTEREDNESS OF TIMUR

The content of Once Upon a Time is compatible with the modern short stories while its title is traditional, and this has created a conflict between this traditional title and its modern form and content.

The titles of two collected stories of Jamal Zadeh and Timur are also opposite; the title Once Upon a Time belongs to the traditional world and reminds us the ancient oral literature. It is in conflict with First Leap which conveys the notion of transformation and renovation.

Jamal Zadeh insists more on language than content while Timur emphasizes the latter instead of the former.

This insistence can be seen in the titles of the two works before reading the content. There is an opposition among the titles of the short stories of First Leap; for example, the title of Bent al-Jiran which is void of any religious color in conflict with such titles as Al Sheikh Jomeh, Amme Motavali, Zarih al-Arbaein and Allah Yarhamuhu. The dominance of religious titles reveals the mental concerns of Timur while in Once Upon a Time Jamalzadeh underlines language more than content by using the folk elements of language and common conversations of people.
LITERARY OPPOSITIONS

From a rhetorical point of view, there are numerous opposing similes in the stories of Jamal Zadeh and Timur. Sometimes oppositions are presented in the form of a simile that the two sides of comparison are in conflict with each other. Most of the oppositions of this type have compared human features with animals’ features.

CONTENT OPPOSITIONS AND OPPOSITION MAKING SIGNS

The content-based oppositions of story reveal the conflict between the traditional world and modern world best. The writer uses some signs in order to show this conflict between tradition and modernity. Having mentioned the content oppositions these signs would be highlighted. These oppositions in many cases constitute opposed ironies.

Reason vs. Superstition: Superstition as a part of traditional world opposes reason which belongs to the modern world. An example of this superstition can be found in "Stomachache of Mulla Qurbanali"; he read a hocus pocus spell over the tails of snake and scorpion and blew it. Most of opposing actions in Timur’s stories are taken where the reason is humiliated, and superstition is praised. Particularly these superstitious beliefs are reflected among the people, momentary and instable beliefs. One of the conflicts existing in the story of Al Sheikh Jomeh is the opposition between childhood and adulthood of the narrator. The childhood of the narrator is full of simplicity and acceptance while in his adulthood he has turned to a critical skeptic based on his rational arguments.

Death and Life: In the two collected stories, thinking of death is more current than thinking of life. In the stories of "Vilan al-Dolah" and "Stomachache of Mulla Qurbanali" death has prevailed the story. Vilan al-Dolah has decided to kill himself thus he commits suicide. Also Mulla Qurbanali after the death of Gohar Khanum proceeds to commit suicide; he slowly moved the rope that was hanging from the berry tree and its shadow was ticking like a pendulum of life and death in which the reader shares the anxiety of life and death of the main character of the story.

East and West: Jamal Zadeh and Timur are both from East and also, they have experience of living in West. East is a symbol of a developing society while West is the paragon of developed society in both collected stories. This opposition becomes uncovered through social-political-cultural criticisms. The conflicts of Timur in this area are less as compared to Jamal Zadeh and have lesser critical streaks.

The opposition of East and West is visible in Al Sheikh Jomeh. The narrator alludes to the lamp in an evening and considers it to be a sign of the development of the Westerners; Don’t you see the lamp which is an important reason of the
development of the Westerners and their skills? Al Sheikh Jomeh believes that the reason of the development of West and underdevelopment of the East lies in their ideological differences: "They have this world and we have the Otherworld" (Fallahi & Taheri, 2015, p.6).

**Traditional Society vs. Modern Society:** In "Stomachache of Mulla Qurbanali" Jamal Zadeh compares the past time with present era as well as the people of a traditional society with the people of modern society:

> People in those times mourned in an intelligible way. There was no house from which at least once in a year the sound of mourning would come... Now it is newspaper that is thriving which has become more prevalent than the infidelity of Satan (Alahdadi & Razaghi, 2018, p. 87).

It needs to be mentioned that in Eastern society there were numerous contradictory social behaviors. In "Statesman" the people who were shouting political slogans with all their hearts after the suppression of the political chaos preferred to play Jacks. These behavioral conflicts which were the result of momentary thinking can also be found in First Leap. In Zarih Al Arbaein the place of main character of the story is continuously changing for people. The climax of the positive side of this change is in the sacredness of this character and the climax of its negative side is in his killing.

**Opposing Social Classes:**

In a traditional society there are numerous opposing social classes like the poor and the rich, the royal and the ordinary. The borders of this opposition collapse in this modern society. Social behaviors are opposing in pre-constitutionalism and post-constitutionalism eras. Before this, the ordinary poor people bribed the authorities but after that, Khan, Minister and Ruler bribed the servants. Jamal Zadeh in Bilah Dig Bilah Choghandar divides Iranian men into three classes of yellow hats (slaves), white hats (clerics) and black hats (authorities and Khans). In Iran of this era, the owners of the land, were of more importance.

**Opposition of Woman and Man:** Woman in the stories of Jamal Zadeh and Timur is hidden and dependent upon the man: "there is a strange thing in this country, and it is the fact that as if there is no woman at all... Not only no woman exists in this country, but also even the name of a woman cannot be called" (Balighi, Abdi & Gheysari, 2016, p.18). In Bilah Dig Bilah Choghandar and Stomachache of Mulla Qurbanali the author uses the title "twat" for woman. Although the signs of this distinction turn less colorful in the ending stories of Once Upon a Time: "Men are shaving the God-given beard and make themselves like women and the latter are growing moustache to make themselves like the men" (Balighi, Abdi & Gheysari, 2016, p.21). Timur pays more attention to women than Jamal Zadeh. In some
stories of Timur women are the manifestations of pleasure. The only woman in the story of Al Sheikh Jomeh is the wife of Jomeh who does not have any independence. In the story of Amme Motavali, there is only a weak character of Hanim – the mother of Nur al-Din. In Zarih Al Arbaein Umma Zarirah plays the role of her motherhood as powerful as she can.

In Father and Son, woman appears in the role of a submissive and passive wife. These all are in addition to the role of beloved which has been described in more detailed fashion in Father and Son and Neighbor's Daughter. Such diversity is not seen in the stories of Jamal Zadeh. In Iranian society no one speaks of the woman but in the stories of Timur there is a conflict between two modes of thought. Abbas Bak, on the one hand, is encountered with his mother who seeks to prevent him from loving women and on the other hand, he is begrudging the tolerance of his friend's mother. Iqbal in this story appears in the form of a woman who is not consistent with the values of eastern society (Timur, 2015, p. 103).

**DISCUSSION**

System of Persian and Arabic literature was based on poetry but the modern literary system has replaced the prose with simple and critical content which is closer to the language and mind of people.

In the stories of Jamal Zadeh, in the wake of the ancient prose texts, sometimes some verses (from Baba Tahir Uryan, Aref, Golestan, odes of Sadi and Abu Saeed) are used. However, there is no direct use of poetry in the stories of Timur and the author has only mentioned the names of some poetic works (poems of Abi Navas, Umar Ibn Abi Rabiah and Abd Al Rahim Al Barei). This shows that the story of Timur has approached the story in its modern sense more than Jamalzadeh.

It is also interesting to note that sometimes the content of texts mentioned in the stories are opposing. For example, itinerary of Haji Baba Isfahani is in conflict with Zad Al Maad or in the story Al Sheikh Jomeh, the romantic ode of Abi Navas and Umar Ibn Abi Rabiah is in conflict with the poetry of Abd Al Rahim Al Barei. One of the sub-narratives of oral and written traditions is myths, which have found a different form and function in modern fiction away from the ancient mythological texts. Myths and mythological elements have left only their names in the modern stories in a way that Rostam and Demon are just figuring on the walls of public bath. The reason for this lies in the fact that literary types have changed and moved from epic genres to fiction writings and its epic tone has been replaced with comic style. Mythological elements in modern fictional texts are associated with streaks of irony. The picture of the war of Rostam and Demon on the wall of bath or the water poured by Khidhr on the head of narrator in the bath or comparing the
beard of the bath keeper to the beard of Rostam in Bilah Dig Bilah Choghandar and comparison of the conditions of Sheikh Jafar in "Statesman" with Kaveh (2016) the Black Smith have added to the satirical dimensions of the story. Few myths existing in the stories of Timur are more descriptive and pictorial than the myths in the stories of Jamalzadeh who has sufficed just to mentioning some words from mythological lexicon.

CONCLUSION

The era of genesis of Persian and Arabic narrative literature was the era of transition from traditional world to modern world of story. A manifestation of this transition era could be analyzed based on narrative oppositions. Upon the study and analysis of these oppositions and conflicts, the following conclusions could be achieved:

In the works of Mahmoud Timur, the titles were more modern and content-centered, but in the stories of Jamal Zadeh the language-centered titles were witnessed.

Intra-character conflicts: Internal conflicts of the main characters in both collected works have brought these characters from the outside world to the inside world—a world in which the contemporary human mind was more involved with it than the outside world.

Opposing cycle of characters in these two collected stories: This opposing cycle exists in the stories of Timur more than Jamal Zadeh and the intensity of its rise and decline was more in the stories of Timur.

Writer-centeredness of Jamal Zadeh and reader-centeredness of Timur: Jamal Zadeh used the first-person point of view in order to take the dynamic power from the audience; but Timur sought to clear a room for the reader through using the third person point of view.

Temporal conflict: Fluidity of time and temporal flashbacks in First Leap were more than Once Upon a Time. Accordingly, the stories of Timur were closer to the modern stories.

Spatial conflict: Jamal Zadeh insisted more on city while Timur created a balance between the city and village. Conflict of action with space also added to the narrative aspect of his stories.

Space opposition: In the conflict between silence and sound, opposing colors, silence and redness (symbol of prosperity/failure) and blackness dominated both collected stories.
Literary conflicts based on criticism: Opposing similes that compare humans and animals in both collected stories which intensified critical and satirical dimensions of the works.

Content conflicts and opposition making signs: Opposition of reason and superstition, death and life, east and west, traditional society and modern society, opposing social behaviors, opposing social classes, woman and man, poetry and prose, conflict of myths in ancient epic context and modern fictional texts. The study of content conflicts indicated that Jamal Zadeh used more bitter satire and criticism than Timur. There were also more modern elements in the stories of Timur as compared to Jamal Zadeh.

REFERENCES


Kaveh (Journal) (2016): *Introduction to Once Upon a Time*, no. 60, 1-28

